# 5 a 9 de julho de 2021

Government's Coalition in distinct Political Systems and the Executive Branch Structure:

An exploratory case of comparative study

Coalizões de Governo em Distintos Sistemas Políticos e a Estrtura do Poder Executivo: Estudo de caso exploratório e comparativo

Coaliciones de Gobierno en Diferentes Sistemas Politicos y la Estructura del Poder Ejecutivo: studio de caso exploratório y comparativo.

Sheila Cristina Tolentino Barbosa<sup>1</sup>

#### **Abstract**

The government's coalitions are commonly examined regarding its effects on governs. Mostly on govern's formation process, governability of minority governs and government stability. Although it is also likely to have significant effects on the structure and results of the executive branch as it is suggested by discussions of the politics of government organizations. This article, in a exploratory comparative case of study, discuss and point out how the trajectory of governments coalitions are related to the trajectory of the executive branch structure, mostly in its increase, regardeless which the political system is.

Keywords: Government's Coalitions; Executive Branch; Structure.

## Resumo

As coalizões de governo são comumente examinadas em relação aos seus efeitos sobre os governos. Principalmente no processo de formação do governo, governabilidade dos governos minoritários e estabilidade do governo, embora também seja provável que tenha efeitos significativos sobre a estrutura e os resultados do poder executivo, conforme sugerido pelas discussões sobre as políticas das organizações governamentais. Este artigo, em um estudo de caso de estudo exploratório comparativo, discute e aponta como a trajetória dos governos coligados está relacionada à trajetória da estrutura do Poder Executivo, principalmente no seu incremento, independente de qual seja o Sistema político.

Palavras-chave: Coalizões de Governo; Poder Executivo; Estrutura.

## Resumen

Las coaliciones gubernamentales se examinan comúnmente por sus efectos sobre los gobiernos. Principalmente en el proceso de formación de gobiernos, gobernanza de gobiernos minoritarios y estabilidad gubernamental, aunque también es probable que tenga efectos significativos en la estructura y resultados del Poder Ejecutivo, como lo sugieren las discusiones sobre las políticas

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Especialista em políticas públicas e gestão governamental como pesquisadora na Diretoria de Estudos e Políticas do Estado, das Instituições e da Democracia (Diest) do Ipea; e professora no Departamento de Gestão de Políticas Públicas da Universidade de Brasília (UnB).

de los organismos gubernamentales. Este artículo, en un estudio de caso exploratorio comparativo, discute y señala cómo la trayectoria de los gobiernos asociados se relaciona con la trayectoria de la estructura del Poder Ejecutivo, principalmente en su incremento. independientemente de cuál sea el sistema politico.

estruc

Palabras Clave: Coaliciones Gubernamentales; Poder Ejecutivo; Estructura.

RESUMO EXPANDIDO

The government's coalitions are commonly examined regarding its effects on governs. Mostly on govern's formation process, governability of minority governs and government stability (See Cheibub and Limongi, 2011). Although it is also likely to have significant effects on the structure and results of the executive branch as it is suggested by discussions of the politics of government organizations, as seen in Ryu et al. (2019), these effects are not often investigated. In fact, apart from the main administrative reforms, changes in the structure of governments seem goes by without being really noticed by the society in large, regardless of in which political system.

Distinct political systems are supposed to present different outcomes on a political scenario of power distribution; however, government coalitions share the same motivation and concern, which are respectively control of government power and government stability, being built by bargains of cabinet positions.

This investigation aims to describe possible correlations between government's coalitions and changes in the executive branch structure in two distinct political systems. For that purpose, this paper will, by an exploratory case of comparative study, describe and analyze the cases of Brazil and New Zealand governments from around 1988. This effort's main contribution derives from the challenge of building a framework on the edge among two fields of knowledge such as political science and public administration.

As pointed by Borges e Barbosa (2019) for Brazil's case over recent years, there is a strong correlation between the increase in the number of parties in government coalitions and significant expansions on the structure of the executive branch. Beyond that, the practice of sharing office positions and ministerial posts in exchange for support for the government of the moment has even visible patterns of party control over government sectors (SILVA e BARBOSA, 2019).

Previous researches are pointing out findings related to the incentives of politicians to seek ministerial post outside of the main parties, under coalitions of minority governs (SHUGART AND TAN, 2016). This situation could lead the political system to more fragmentation regarding the number of political parties, an increase of coalitions size, and finally, on more fragmentation of the executive branch structure and action.

This research derives from a broader research agenda about Brazil and the choice of New as case control case took in consideration that New Zealand has some useful features. The most important common feature for the two countries is that at the selected period of time they were under formal directives to reduce the government machinery. So both of them were not supposed to show increases in their structures as they indeed have shown

To explore possible correlations as mentioned above, first, it is examined relevant features of both political systems and, the process of government formation, and appointments for cabinet positions, as the government structure is an expression of the set of positions. Secondly, it is discussed data about the respective executive branch structures for the period under investigation. Finally, this discussion is followed by an analysis of possible existing correlations between increasing coalitions of government and the path of changes in the structure of the executive branch under its specifical rules of appointments.

To understand transformations in the organization of the public sector, at a Federal/national level, and its political determinants this analysis was carried out by both qualitative and quantitative research and comparative analysis of multiple cases (Brazil and New Zealand cases). The fact that they have distinct political system was intend to make possible to analyse if coalitons or the political systems were a differential aspect.

The comparative analysis of the public administration organization in countries with different political systems can be helpful to identify differential elements regarding the influence of each political system on the shape of government, all this by an exam and comparison of similarities and differences in their characteristics and its results. Firstly, a description of both political systems features is provided, including its respective number of parties in recent years, either in parliament and coalitions by each government. Secondly, it is presented a detailed description of the trajectory of state sector organizations for both countries. Subsequently, it was performed an analysis to compare the trajectories of both coalitions and the respective government structure by using the statistical test of *spearman* correlation.

It is important to stress that the countries under analysis have distinct mandates periods,

which are 3 years for New Zealand and 4 years for Brazil. Nevertheless the comparison was not among periods of time but about features of each government mandate. Thereby, first the data analysis has made comparisons among government mandates of each country in order to describe a trajectory for each one, so that both trajectories could be compared among themselves.

The data collection was focused on initial cabinet formations at each government to trace the impact of the transition from one government to another over the administrative structure of government in each country. In this case, the length of time for each minister has not being considered, but the staffing process at each government transition, as this would be the moment of significant changes in the coalitions and potentially with more significant repercussions on ministerial changes (Ryu at al, 2019:7). Information on ministerial composition and ministers party affiliation was collected from official sources and databases of published research. Also, an analysis of content was conducted on describing previous researches and normative documents that define the way to create and staff the states sector organizations on Federal Level.

The measure of which and how many parties take part in government coalition was based on the party affiliation of ministers and, in Brazil's case, other heads of organizational units with a ministry status. It should be noted that, in any case, there are possible limitations of this measure. However, it is understood as feasible and valid for the research objectives, as already discussed above.

In Brazil's case of analysis, the temporal cut-off is the period right after the recent redemocratization in 1985 until 2016. For the New Zealand study Case, it was selected a parallel period beginning 1987 until the last election in 2017. The most important aspect about it is that similarly, these periods of time were also parallel regarding recent public managent reforms that were supposed to shape the public administration under the same directives of reduction of structure and effectiveness.

The variables analyzed were the number of parties with seats in parliament, the coalitions size, the number and types of ministries, departments and other organizations on the state sector, and the process of appointment for cabinet, ministries, and superior departments or government enterprises.

The Analysis shows that despite times of economic crises, the state sector at the national level both in Brazil and New Zealand have been increased following the increase of political parties in coalitions of government.

Different political systems and their particular government coalition models do affect the executive branch structure in the same way, considering that the increase in fragmentation of coalitions, is followed by an increase in the number of organizations of the public sector, which means even more fragmented machinery of government. Even in different social-economic contexts. Moreover, in a contradictory situation of fiscal crisis, that reasonably would suggest a trajectory of decrease in the public sector structure and action.

In regards of the way that governments organize their functions and actions, apparently, the increases in governmental structures are towards those parts of government where the political appointments are available and where the coalition can hold more power over organizations, which means at the whole executive Branch in Brazil's case, and The Crown entities at New Zealand's Case.

Although one could claim that it was after the New Public Management reforms the public sector became more fragmented, it is important to highlight that this kind of fragmentation mostly happened where the political appoint still is an option, as the public services in New Zealand has remained stable. This observation leads us to some important reflections about to which extent the political system, in other words, the parties, are shaping the organizational trajectories of the public sector. Furthermore, to which extent the shape and capacity of public services are at service of parties interests and needs. Those are questions to be examined by further studies.

## References

Borges, J. S. & Barbosa, S. C. T. (2019). Ministérios como'barganha': coalizão de governo e organização do Poder Executivo. Revista do Serviço Público, 70(2), 267-296.

Cheibub, J. A., & Limongi, F. (2011). From conflict to coordination: Perspectives on the study of executive-legislative relations. Revista Ibero-Americana de Estudos Legislativos, 1(1), 38-53.

Ryu, L., Moon, M. J., & Yang, J. (2019). The politics of government reorganizations: Evidence from 30 OECD countries, 1980–2014. Governance, DOI:10.1111/gove.12458

Silva, N. D., & Barbosa, S. C. T. (2019). Trajetória da ocupação partidária nos setores temáticos da estrutura do Poder Executivo (1986-2016).

Shugart, M. S. and Tan, A. C. Political Consequences of New Zealand's MMP System in Comparative Perspective. In Batto, N. F., Huang, C., Tan, A. C., & Cox, G. W. (2016). Mixed-member electoral systems in constitutional context: Taiwan, Japan, and beyond. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press. DOI:10.3998/mpub.8084028